Illicit Massage Establishments

Proposed Ordinance Amendments
Minal Patel Davis
Special Advisor to the Mayor on Human Trafficking
minal.davis@houstontx.gov and 832.393.0977
Todd Latiolais with Children at Risk
Tlatiolais@childrenatrisk.org and 713.869.7740
Role Overview

- Appointed as Special Advisor to the Mayor on Human Trafficking on June 29, 2015
- Role includes coordinating services, managing the affairs of the Mayor’s Houston Area Council on Human Trafficking, increasing awareness
- I was the volunteer chair of this Council/Task Force for 6 months prior to being appointed
- Examining ordinances and making recommendations that set a different tone in our city
Outline

- Overview on Human Trafficking and reasons for change
- National and Local Information on Illicit Massage Businesses (IMB’s)
- Local IMB Advertisements and Scope
- Dallas and San Antonio Ordinances, district breakdowns
- Discuss proposed changes to Chapter 28, Misc. Offenses and Provisions, Article XII. Massage Establishments
- Benefits and Costs
- Timeline and Stakeholders
Human Trafficking Definitions

- Human Trafficking occurs when a trafficker uses force, fraud or coercion to control another person for the purpose of engaging in commercial sex acts or soliciting labor or services against his or her will.

- No force, fraud or coercion is required if the person engaged in a commercial sex act is under 18 years old.

- The crime despite its name does not require movement.

- Some examples are street or web based, pimp controlled prostitution.

- Relevant manifestation for today are the IMB’s that are sometimes fronts for Human Trafficking.
Polaris Project - National Hotline calls

Location of potential human trafficking cases reported to the National Human Trafficking Resource Center (2007 - 2012)
National IMB Estimates

- Polaris has experience serving women from IMB’s, has reviewed law enforcement reports, service provider reports, public records, and media accounts

- Polaris estimates that 1 IMB on average has 3 women who average 4 customers a day, each customer pays the average house fee of $60

- With an estimated 9,000 IMB’s based on sex buyer review boards, they generate an estimated $6,000,000 a day
Purpose

- In order to help combat human trafficking in the City of Houston, City Council is asked to amend Chapter 28 of the code of ordinances.

- IMB’s often help to facilitate the illegal sex trade, human trafficking and pose a particular threat to the safety, health and wellbeing of Houstonians.

- Recent research shows that Houston is home to more active IMB’s than any other city in Texas.

- The latest search conducted on 9/14/2015 showed 240 IMB’s offering services online out of a running list of 387 places because the IMB’s open and close.
Purpose

- On the same day, the list of 240 IMB’s was crossed with a list of state licensed establishments, only 9 of the establishments that advertised suggestive services on the internet had a state license.

- The current ordinance only authorizes law enforcement to conduct inspections at state licensed massage establishments.

- The proposed ordinance changes will allow law enforcement to inspect businesses that have a state license, but also those that advertise massages and should have a state license.

- It will also recognize that law enforcement action and access is required to assist in closing these parlors while balancing legitimate business owners interests.
Illicit Spas/Massage Parlors

- Open at odd hours, legal hours of operation are from 8 AM - 10 PM
- Unusual suggestive names
- Barred Windows
- Cameras
- Asian Populations
- Commercial Sex with 4-5 men per day
Volume of Paid Sex Ads in Houston

- January
- February
- March
- April
- May
- June
Online Massage Ads

&^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^^ YOUNG YOUNG YOUNG GIRLS ♥♥♥♥♥♥♥♥ CALL: ☑️♥️♥️♥️♥️ All
New GIRLS
Posted: Thursday, November 9, 2017

♥ NEW OPENING ♥

Let our amazing body work relive your daily stress. You will love our clean and luxurious private rooms. We are anxious to give you our best service, CALL NOW!

------------------

♥- NEW NEW HOT GIRLS EVERY WEEK
♥- Latina & Korean & Vietnamese
♥- VERY SEXY & SWEET
♥- Table Shower
♥- ATM available

------------------
Buyer Reviews
How Does Houston Compare?

Active Illicit Massage Parlors in Texas

- Houston
- San Antonio
- Dallas
- El Paso
- Plano
- Austin
- Richardson
- Arlington
- Katy
- Spring

Source: Polaris Project; (2014)
Ordinance Comparison

- **Dallas** – Local permit required and a $200 permit fee for each establishment; inspector may inspect for health and safety reasons. If they have probable cause to enter, entry is denied, they make application for a search warrant.

- **San Antonio** – Local permit required, $75 annual fee, and ordinance declares all massage establishments public places.

- **City of Houston** - No recommendation of permitting, expanding definition of Massage Establishment to include those that advertise using massage and to incorporate access language at the local level.
# District Counts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Council Member</th>
<th>Count of Name</th>
<th>Percentage of Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RICHARD NGUYEN</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OLIVER PENNINGTON</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OUTSIDE AREA</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIKE LASTER</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRENDA STARDIG</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELLEN R COHEN</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROBERT GALLEGOS</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAVID MARTIN</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JERRY DAVIS</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DWIGHT BOYKINS</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LARRY GREEN</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDWARD GONZALEZ</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Grand Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>387</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Illicit Massage Businesses
Human Trafficking & Prostitution-Related Incidents by Premise Type

Note: “Government” indicates locations such as police stations and hospitals. Addresses are sometimes used to generate reports while investigations are ongoing.
Source: HPD Crime Database

2-year total: 4,127
Proposed Changes Sec. 28-361. Definitions.

*Massage establishment* means any building, room, place, or any establishment whose business includes advertising or offering a massage or other massage services, other than a regularly licensed hospital, medical clinic, or licensed physical therapy treatment facility where massage is practiced upon the human body for compensation by any person not a duly licensed physician or chiropractor, whether with or without the use of mechanical, therapeutic or bathing devices, and shall include Turkish bathhouses. This term shall not include beauty parlors or barbershops duly licensed by the state, or licensed hospitals, medical clinics, however, beauty parlors or barbershops duly licensed by the state, or licensed physical therapy facilities or establishments places wherein registered physical therapists treating only patients recommended and referred by a licensed physician and operate only under such physician's direction.
Proposed Changes Sec. 28-361. Definitions.

Additionally, the term shall not include a place of business where a licensed massage therapist practices as a solo practitioner in a manner consistent with the applicable provisions of Section 455.155 of the Texas Occupations Code, as amended.
A peace officer appointed or employed by a law enforcement agency of this state may enter the premises of a massage establishment pursuant to Sections 455.104 and 455.353 of the Texas Occupations Code. If entry and access to the premises of the massage establishment is denied, entry shall be made under the authority of a warrant to inspect the massage establishment.

Sec. 28-361. Definitions.
- Massage definition - Adding massage therapy and including devices used to offer massage
- Massage therapist definition – Adding someone who practices massage therapy and references other massage services as ascribed in TOC section 455.001

Sec. 28-362. ME license display requirement
- Adding massage establishment or a place of business that advertises massage therapy

Sec 28-363. Maintenance of premises and equipment
- Instruments shall be sterilized on a regular basis and rendered free from harmful organisms in a manner consistent with state law

Sec 28-369. Accommodation of diseased patrons prohibited.
- Adding operator, manager or person in charge instead of custodian

Sec. 28-371. Penalty.
- Adding each violation shall constitute and be punishable as a separate offense

Sec. 28-372 Cumulative Effect.
- The provisions of this article are cumulative of applicable state law and regulations concerning massage establishments. To the extent there exists any difference or inconsistency between the provisions of this article and applicable state law or regulations, the more restrictive shall apply.
Benefits and Cost

- Close a loophole that allows the IMB’s to proliferate
- Enable DRT to more easily obtain a search warrant
- Increase the ratio of officers and make it easier for them to assist in enforcing this regulation against IMB’s
- Assets in place and already involved, proposed changes will have increased impact
- No additional cost to City
# Timeline - Stakeholders

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>June</th>
<th>July</th>
<th>August</th>
<th>September</th>
<th>October</th>
<th>November</th>
<th>December</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MPD Started Job</td>
<td>-HPD Vice and Children at Risk Input</td>
<td>Start outreach to stakeholders</td>
<td>Massage Envy Regional Therapist Support Manager</td>
<td>Started Council Member Outreach</td>
<td>-Council Member Outreach Continues and follow up emails sent</td>
<td>Council Agenda, planned for 12/2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-DRT Illicit Massage Establishment Training</td>
<td>AMTA Houston Chapter Board President</td>
<td>NCBTMB National Certification Board for Therapeutic Massage and Bodywork</td>
<td>Human Trafficking Symposium</td>
<td>-City Legal provides stakeholder draft for circulation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-HPD Ride Along - Illicit Massage Establishment Operation</td>
<td>Eliminated chains with no Houston locations</td>
<td>ABMP-Associated Bodywork and Massage Professionals</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-MPD circulated draft for input to below stakeholders same day</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-Massage Envy Franchisee, Regional Therapist Support Manager, AMTA Houston Unit Board Chair and AMTA TX Chapter President engage. AMTA TX Chapter President provides letter of support. All provide input.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Hand and Stone</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Massage Heights</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>City Legal - Attorney assigned</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-Laurel Massage School</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-Massage Instructor Lonestar College</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-Stakeholder Meeting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-Draft reflecting stakeholder concerns circulated to stakeholders and posted to COH website</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-Public Safety Committee Meeting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Letter of Support from the American Massage Therapy Association:

“...Texas Chapter supports efforts of COH in amendments to Chapter 28 for the purposes of helping eliminate human trafficking and illicit businesses hiding behind the profession of massage therapy.”
Conclusion

- Changes to Chapter 28, Misc Offenses and Provisions Article XII. Massage Establishments

- Proposed changes will expand the definition of massage establishments to include those that advertise and added access language will make it easier for HPD to engage

- Contact information, Minal Patel Davis:
  email: minal.davis@houstontx.gov
  office: 832.393.0977
  mobile: 832.596.9965

- Contact information, Todd Latiolais:
  email: tlatiolais@childrenatrisk.org
  office: 713.869.7740