CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Application Date: April 24, 2017

Applicant: Matt Grauvogl, RSFM Inc., for John J. Alappatt, JJA Investment Group, owner

Property: 808 W Main St, Tract 12, Block 18, Lockhart Connor & Barziza Subdivision. The property includes a historic 2,500 square foot, two-story wood frame single-family residence (which has been converted to commerical use) situated on a 5,000 square foot (50' x 100') interior lot.

Significance: Contributing Craftsman-style residence, constructed circa 1915, located in the First Montrose Commons Historic District.

Proposal: Alteration – Siding/Trim

Replace all original 4" lap wood siding with 4" cementitious siding.

Staff visited the property on May 5, 2017, and observed some areas of siding that were either damaged beyond repair or had peeling paint. Staff found that the extent of the damage did not warrant replacing all the historic siding on the front and side elevations. The historic siding was repaired approximately two years ago, but the repair efforts were insufficient. Repairing/replacing the limited areas of damaged siding would qualify as "ordinary maintenance and repair," and would not require a COA.

See enclosed application materials and detailed project description on p. 4-7 for further details.

Public Comment: No public comment received.

Civic Association: No comment received.

Recommendation: **Denial - does not satisfy criteria 1, 4, or 9**

HAHC Action: **Denied**

APPROVAL CRITERIA

ALTERATIONS, REHABILITATIONS, RESTORATIONS AND ADDITIONS

Sec. 33-241: HAHC shall issue a certificate of appropriateness for the alteration, rehabilitation, restoration or addition of an exterior feature of (i) any landmark, (ii) protected landmark, (iii) any building, structure or object that is part of an archaeological site, or (iv) contributing building in a historic district upon finding that the application satisfies the following criteria, as applicable:

S - satisfies D - does not satisfy NA - not applicable

S	D	NA		
☐	☒	☐	(1)	The proposed activity must retain and preserve the historical character of the property; *Replacing original siding that is not damaged beyond repair does not preserve the historical character of the property.*
☒	☐	☐	(2)	The proposed activity must contribute to the continued availability of the property for a contemporary use;
☒	☐	☐	(3)	The proposed activity must recognize the building, structure, object or site as a product of its own time and avoid alterations that seek to create an earlier or later appearance;
☐	☒	☐	(4)	The proposed activity must preserve the distinguishing qualities or character of the building, structure, object or site and its environment; *Replacing original siding that is not damaged beyond repair does not preserve the distinguishing qualities of the building.*
☒	☐	☐	(5)	The proposed activity must maintain or replicate distinctive stylistic exterior features or examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize the building, structure, object or site;
☒	☐	☐	(6)	New materials to be used for any exterior feature excluding what is visible from public alleys must be visually compatible with, but not necessarily the same as, the materials being replaced in form, design, texture, dimension and scale;
☐	☐	☒	(7)	The proposed replacement of missing exterior features, if any, should be based on an accurate duplication of features, substantiated by available historical, physical or pictorial evidence, where that evidence is available, rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other structures;
☒	☐	☐	(8)	Proposed additions or alterations must be done in a manner that, if removed in the future, would leave unimpaired the essential form and integrity of the building, structure, object or site;
☐	☒	☐	(9)	The proposed design for any exterior alterations or addition must not destroy significant historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural material, including but not limited to siding, windows, doors and porch elements; *Removing historic siding destroys historical and architectural material.*
☒	☐	☐	(10)	The proposed alteration or addition must be compatible with the massing, size, scale material and character of the property and the context area; and
☒	☐	☐	(11)	The distance from the property line to the front and side walls, porches, and exterior features of any proposed addition or alteration must be compatible with the distance to the property line of similar elements of existing contributing structures in the context area.

N

PROPERTY LOCATION

FIRST MONTROSE COMMONS HISTORIC DISTRICT

CURRENT PHOTO

STAFF PHOTOS – SAMPLE CONDITIONS

East (side) elevation

East (side) elevation

East (side) elevation

East (side) elevation

East (side) elevation

South (front) elevation

West (side) elevation

ATTACHMENT A