

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Application Date: September 2, 2016

Applicant: Larry & Diane Tucker, owner

Property: 8223 Colgate Street, Lot 19, Block 46, Glenbrook Valley Subdivision. The property includes a historic 2,533 square foot, one-story wood, brick veneer frame single-family residence and an attached garage situated on a 10,800 square foot interior lot.

Significance: Contributing Mid-century Modern residence, constructed circa 1965, located in the Glenbrook Valley Historic District.

Proposal: Alteration – Siding

- Removed all original Board and Batten wood siding from the front gable and eaves on the entire house.
- Replaced removed siding with cementitious Board and Batten siding to simulate the material removed.
- The applicant made the replacement prior to learning a permit was required and is applying now for retroactive approval. Because work has already been complete, staff was unable to verify the condition of the original material and whether it required replacement.

See enclosed application materials and detailed project description on p. 3-6 for further details.

Public Comment: No public comment received at this time.

Civic Association: No comment received.

Recommendation: Denial - does not satisfy criteria 1 & 9

Staff recommends a Certificate of Remediation for the siding replacement. Since the historic siding has been disposed of and these actions therefore cannot be reversed, a Certificate of Remediation will allow the project to be finalized without the Commission deeming the unauthorized siding removal as appropriate.

HAHC Action: -

APPROVAL CRITERIA

ALTERATIONS, REHABILITATIONS, RESTORATIONS AND ADDITIONS

Sec. 33-241: HAHC shall issue a certificate of appropriateness for the alteration, rehabilitation, restoration or addition of an exterior feature of (i) any landmark, (ii) protected landmark, (iii) any building, structure or object that is part of an archaeological site, or (iv) contributing building in a historic district upon finding that the application satisfies the following criteria, as applicable:

- | S | D | NA | |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|
| | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (1) The proposed activity must retain and preserve the historical character of the property;
<i>Replacing the original siding with different material does not retain and preserve the historical character of the property.</i> |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (2) The proposed activity must contribute to the continued availability of the property for a contemporary use; |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (3) The proposed activity must recognize the building, structure, object or site as a product of its own time and avoid alterations that seek to create an earlier or later appearance; |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (4) The proposed activity must preserve the distinguishing qualities or character of the building, structure, object or site and its environment; |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (5) The proposed activity must maintain or replicate distinctive stylistic exterior features or examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize the building, structure, object or site; |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (6) New materials to be used for any exterior feature excluding what is visible from public alleys must be visually compatible with, but not necessarily the same as, the materials being replaced in form, design, texture, dimension and scale;
<i>The new siding has the same appearance as the original, and is therefore visually compatible with but not necessarily the same as, the materials that were replaced in form, design, texture, dimension and scale.</i> |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | (7) The proposed replacement of missing exterior features, if any, should be based on an accurate duplication of features, substantiated by available historical, physical or pictorial evidence, where that evidence is available, rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other structures; |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (8) Proposed additions or alterations must be done in a manner that, if removed in the future, would leave unimpaired the essential form and integrity of the building, structure, object or site; |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (9) The proposed design for any exterior alterations or addition must not destroy significant historical, architectural, archaeological or cultural material, including but not limited to siding, windows, doors and porch elements.
<i>The removal and disposal of original wood siding destroyed significant historical material found on Mid-century Modern homes. Historic siding should be retained unless damaged beyond reasonable repair. Because the applicant replaced the siding before speaking with staff, staff was unable to evaluate the condition of the siding prior to removal.</i> |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | (10) The proposed alteration or addition must be compatible with the massing, size, scale, material and character of the property and the context area; and |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | (11) The distance from the property line to the front and side walls, porches, and exterior features of any proposed addition or alteration must be compatible with the distance to the property line of similar elements of existing contributing structures in the context area. |



PROPERTY LOCATION
GLENBROOK VALLEY HISTORIC DISTRICT

Building Classification

- Contributing
- Non-Contributing
- Park



INVENTORY PHOTO



PHOTO OF SIDING

BEFORE



AFTER

